

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol.

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

Propositional Forms:

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

Propositional Forms:  $\wedge, \vee, \neg, P \implies Q \equiv \neg P \vee Q$ .



## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

Propositional Forms:  $\wedge, \vee, \neg, P \implies Q \equiv \neg P \vee Q$ .

Truth Table. Putting together identities. (E.g., cases, substitution.)

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

Propositional Forms:  $\wedge, \vee, \neg, P \implies Q \equiv \neg P \vee Q$ .

Truth Table. Putting together identities. (E.g., cases, substitution.)

Predicates,  $P(x)$ , and quantifiers.  $\forall x, P(x)$ .

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

Propositional Forms:  $\wedge, \vee, \neg, P \implies Q \equiv \neg P \vee Q$ .

Truth Table. Putting together identities. (E.g., cases, substitution.)

Predicates,  $P(x)$ , and quantifiers.  $\forall x, P(x)$ .

DeMorgan's:  $\neg(P \vee Q) \equiv \neg P \wedge \neg Q$ .

## Review.



Theory: If you drink alcohol you must be at least 18.

Which cards do you turn over?

Drink Alcohol  $\implies$  " $\geq 18$ "

" $< 18$ "  $\implies$  Don't Drink Alcohol. Contrapositive.

(A) (B) (C) and/or (D)?

Propositional Forms:  $\wedge, \vee, \neg, P \implies Q \equiv \neg P \vee Q$ .

Truth Table. Putting together identities. (E.g., cases, substitution.)

Predicates,  $P(x)$ , and quantifiers.  $\forall x, P(x)$ .

DeMorgan's:  $\neg(P \vee Q) \equiv \neg P \wedge \neg Q$ .  $\neg \forall x, P(x) \equiv \exists x, \neg P(x)$ .

## CS70: Lecture 2. Outline.

Today: Proofs!!!

1. By Example.
2. Direct. (Prove  $P \implies Q$ .)
3. by Contraposition (Prove  $P \implies Q$ )
4. by Contradiction (Prove  $P$ .)
5. by Cases

If time: discuss induction.

Last time: Existential statement.

How to prove existential statement?

## Last time: Existential statement.

How to prove existential statement?

Give an example. (Sometimes called "proof by example.")

## Last time: Existential statement.

How to prove existential statement?

Give an example. (Sometimes called "proof by example.")

**Theorem:**  $(\exists x \in \mathcal{N})(x = x^2)$



## Last time: Existential statement.

How to prove existential statement?

Give an example. (Sometimes called "proof by example.")

**Theorem:**  $(\exists x \in \mathbb{N})(x = x^2)$

**Pf:**  $0 = 0^2 = 0$

## Last time: Existential statement.

How to prove existential statement?

Give an example. (Sometimes called "proof by example.")

**Theorem:**  $(\exists x \in \mathbb{N})(x = x^2)$

**Pf:**  $0 = 0^2 = 0$



Often used to disprove claim.

## Last time: Existential statement.

How to prove existential statement?

Give an example. (Sometimes called "proof by example.")

**Theorem:**  $(\exists x \in \mathbb{N})(x = x^2)$

**Pf:**  $0 = 0^2 = 0$



Often used to disprove claim.

Homework.

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ?

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ?



## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

$$4|2?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

$$4|2?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

$$4|2?$$

$$2|-4?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

$$4|2?$$

$$2|-4?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$$2|4?$$

$$7|23?$$

$$4|2?$$

$$2|-4?$$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes!

$7|23$ ? No!

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes!

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .



## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes!

$7|23$ ? No!

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes!

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes!

$7|23$ ? No!

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes!

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes!

$7|23$ ? No!

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes!

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,  $15 = 3(5)$ .

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $4 = (2)2$ .

$7|23$ ? No!

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $-4 = (-2)2$ .

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,  $15 = 3(5)$ .

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $4 = (2)2$ .

$7|23$ ? No! No  $q$  where true.

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = -2$ ,  $-4 = (-2)2$ .

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,  $15 = 3(5)$ .

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $4 = (2)2$ .

$7|23$ ? No! No  $q$  where true.

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $-4 = (-2)2$ .

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,  $15 = 3(5)$ .

A natural number  $p > 1$ , is **prime** if it is divisible only by 1 and itself.

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $4 = (2)2$ .

$7|23$ ? No! No  $q$  where true.

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $-4 = (-2)2$ .

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,  $15 = 3(5)$ .

A natural number  $p > 1$ , is **prime** if it is divisible only by 1 and itself.

A number  $x$  is even if and only if  $2|x$ , or  $x = 2k$  for  $x, k \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

## Quick Background and Notation.

Integers closed under addition.

$$a, b \in \mathbb{Z} \implies a + b \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$a|b$  means “a divides b”.

$2|4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $4 = (2)2$ .

$7|23$ ? No! No  $q$  where true.

$4|2$ ? No!

$2|-4$ ? Yes! Since for  $q = 2$ ,  $-4 = (-2)2$ .

Formally: for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a|b \iff \exists q \in \mathbb{Z}$  where  $b = aq$ .

$3|15$  since for  $q = 5$ ,  $15 = 3(5)$ .

A natural number  $p > 1$ , is **prime** if it is divisible only by 1 and itself.

A number  $x$  is even if and only if  $2|x$ , or  $x = 2k$  for  $x, k \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

A number  $x$  is odd if and only if  $x = 2k + 1$



## Divides.

$a|b$  means

- (A) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $a = kb$ .
- (B) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $b = ka$ .
- (C) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , with  $b = ka$ .
- (D) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $k = ab$ .
- (E)  $a$  divides  $b$

## Divides.

$a|b$  means

- (A) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $a = kb$ .
- (B) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $b = ka$ .
- (C) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , with  $b = ka$ .
- (D) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $k = ab$ .
- (E)  $a$  divides  $b$

Incorrect: (C) sufficient not necessary. (A) Wrong way. (D) the product is an integer.

## Divides.

$a|b$  means

- (A) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $a = kb$ .
- (B) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $b = ka$ .
- (C) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , with  $b = ka$ .
- (D) There exists  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , with  $k = ab$ .
- (E)  $a$  divides  $b$

Incorrect: (C) sufficient not necessary. (A) Wrong way. (D) the product is an integer.

Correct: (B) and (E).

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq'$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$b = aq$  and  $c = aq'$  where  $q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$



## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq'$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q')$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$$(b - c) = a(q - q')$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$



## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$



Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?



## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$



Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?

Argument applies to *every*  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Used distributive property and definition of divides.

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$



Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?

Argument applies to *every*  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Used distributive property and definition of divides.

Direct Proof Form:

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$

□

Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?

Argument applies to *every*  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Used distributive property and definition of divides.

Direct Proof Form:

Goal:  $P \implies Q$

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$

□

Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?

Argument applies to *every*  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Used distributive property and definition of divides.

Direct Proof Form:

Goal:  $P \implies Q$

Assume  $P$ .

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$



Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?

Argument applies to *every*  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Used distributive property and definition of divides.

Direct Proof Form:

Goal:  $P \implies Q$

Assume  $P$ .

...

## Direct Proof.

**Theorem:** For any  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b$  and  $a|c$  then  $a|(b - c)$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $a|b$  and  $a|c$

$$b = aq \text{ and } c = aq' \text{ where } q, q' \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$b - c = aq - aq' = a(q - q') \text{ Done?}$$

$(b - c) = a(q - q')$  and  $(q - q')$  is an integer so **by definition of divides**

$$a|(b - c)$$

□

Works for  $\forall a, b, c$ ?

Argument applies to *every*  $a, b, c \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Used distributive property and definition of divides.

Direct Proof Form:

Goal:  $P \implies Q$

Assume  $P$ .

...

Therefore  $Q$ .

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .



## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$$n = 121$$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$$n = 121 \quad \text{Alt Sum: } 1 - 2 + 1 = 0.$$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$$n = 121 \quad \text{Alt Sum: } 1 - 2 + 1 = 0. \text{ Divis. by } 11.$$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$



## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11.

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is 605

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c$



## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b$$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,  $k + 9a + b$  is integer.

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,  $k + 9a + b$  is integer.  $\implies 11|n$ .

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,  $k + 9a + b$  is integer.  $\implies 11|n$ . □



## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11|n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,  $k + 9a + b$  is integer.  $\implies 11|n$ . □

Direct proof of  $P \implies Q$ :

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,  $k + 9a + b$  is integer.  $\implies 11|n$ . □

Direct proof of  $P \implies Q$ :

Assumed  $P$ :  $11|a - b + c$ .

## Another direct proof.

Let  $D_3$  be the 3 digit natural numbers.

Theorem: For  $n \in D_3$ , if the alternating sum of digits of  $n$  is divisible by 11, then  $11|n$ .

$$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$$

Examples:

$n = 121$  Alt Sum:  $1 - 2 + 1 = 0$ . Divis. by 11. As is 121.

$n = 605$  Alt Sum:  $6 - 0 + 5 = 11$  Divis. by 11. As is  $605 = 11(55)$

**Proof:** For  $n \in D_3$ ,  $n = 100a + 10b + c$ , for some  $a, b, c$ .

Assume: Alt. sum:  $a - b + c = 11k$  for some integer  $k$ .

Add  $99a + 11b$  to both sides.

$$100a + 10b + c = 11k + 99a + 11b = 11(k + 9a + b)$$

Left hand side is  $n$ ,  $k + 9a + b$  is integer.  $\implies 11|n$ . □

Direct proof of  $P \implies Q$ :

Assumed  $P$ :  $11|a - b + c$ . Proved  $Q$ :  $11|n$ .

# The Converse

Thm:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11 \mid \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 \mid n$

# The Converse

Thm:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$

Is converse a theorem?

$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | n) \implies (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

# The Converse

Thm:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$

Is converse a theorem?

$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | n) \implies (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

Yes?

# The Converse

Thm:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \implies 11 | n$

Is converse a theorem?

$\forall n \in D_3, (11 | n) \implies (11 | \text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

Yes? No?

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$



## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:**

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k$$

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$\begin{aligned}n &= 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies \\99a + 11b + (a - b + c) &= 11k\end{aligned}$$

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b$$

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b)$$

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell$$

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$



## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$

That is  $11|\text{alternating sum of digits}$ . □

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$

That is  $11|\text{alternating sum of digits}$ . □

Note: similar proof to other. In this case every  $\implies$  is  $\iff$

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$

That is  $11|\text{alternating sum of digits}$ . □

Note: similar proof to other. In this case every  $\implies$  is  $\iff$

Often works with arithmetic properties ...

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$

That is  $11|\text{alternating sum of digits}$ . □

Note: similar proof to other. In this case every  $\implies$  is  $\iff$

Often works with arithmetic properties ...

...**not** when multiplying by 0.

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$

That is  $11|\text{alternating sum of digits}$ . □

Note: similar proof to other. In this case every  $\implies$  is  $\iff$

Often works with arithmetic properties ...

...**not** when multiplying by 0.

We have.

## Another Direct Proof.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in D_3, (11|n) \implies (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n)$

**Proof:** Assume  $11|n$ .

$$n = 100a + 10b + c = 11k \implies$$

$$99a + 11b + (a - b + c) = 11k \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11k - 99a - 11b \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11(k - 9a - b) \implies$$

$$a - b + c = 11\ell \text{ where } \ell = (k - 9a - b) \in \mathbb{Z}$$

That is  $11|\text{alternating sum of digits}$ . □

Note: similar proof to other. In this case every  $\implies$  is  $\iff$

Often works with arithmetic properties ...

...**not** when multiplying by 0.

We have.

Theorem:  $\forall n \in N', (11|\text{alt. sum of digits of } n) \iff (11|n)$

# Proof by Contraposition

## Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.



## Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

## Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .



# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

$$n = qd$$

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

$$n = qd = q(2k)$$

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

$$n = qd = q(2k) = 2(kq)$$

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

$$n = qd = q(2k) = 2(kq)$$

$n$  is even.

# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$$n = kd \text{ and } n = 2k' + 1 \text{ for integers } k, k'.$$

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

$$n = qd = q(2k) = 2(kq)$$

$n$  is even.  $\neg P$



# Proof by Contraposition

Thm: For  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  and  $d|n$ . If  $n$  is odd then  $d$  is odd.

$n = kd$  and  $n = 2k' + 1$  for integers  $k, k'$ .

what do we know about  $d$ ?

Goal: Prove  $P \implies Q$ .

Assume  $\neg Q$

...and prove  $\neg P$ .

Conclusion:  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$  equivalent to  $P \implies Q$ .

**Proof:** Assume  $\neg Q$ :  $d$  is even.  $d = 2k$ .

$d|n$  so we have

$$n = qd = q(2k) = 2(kq)$$

$n$  is even.  $\neg P$



Another Contraposition...

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

$n^2$  is even,  $n^2 = 2k$ , ...

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

$n^2$  is even,  $n^2 = 2k$ , ...  $\sqrt{2k}$  even?

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:**  $(P \implies Q) \equiv (\neg Q \implies \neg P)$

$P = 'n^2$  is even.' .....

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'



## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$n = 2k + 1$

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$$n = 2k + 1$$

$$n^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$$n = 2k + 1$$

$$n^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

$$n^2 = 2l + 1 \text{ where } l \text{ is a natural number..}$$

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$$n = 2k + 1$$

$$n^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

$n^2 = 2l + 1$  where  $l$  is a natural number..

... and  $n^2$  is odd!

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$$n = 2k + 1$$

$$n^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

$n^2 = 2l + 1$  where  $l$  is a natural number..

... and  $n^2$  is odd!

$$\neg Q \implies \neg P$$



## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$$n = 2k + 1$$

$$n^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

$n^2 = 2l + 1$  where  $l$  is a natural number..

... and  $n^2$  is odd!

$\neg Q \implies \neg P$  so  $P \implies Q$  and ...

## Another Contraposition...

**Lemma:** For every  $n$  in  $N$ ,  $n^2$  is even  $\implies n$  is even. ( $P \implies Q$ )

**Proof by contraposition:** ( $P \implies Q$ )  $\equiv$  ( $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ )

$P =$  ' $n^2$  is even.' .....  $\neg P =$  ' $n^2$  is odd'

$Q =$  ' $n$  is even' .....  $\neg Q =$  ' $n$  is odd'

Prove  $\neg Q \implies \neg P$ :  $n$  is odd  $\implies n^2$  is odd.

$$n = 2k + 1$$

$$n^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

$n^2 = 2l + 1$  where  $l$  is a natural number..

... and  $n^2$  is odd!

$\neg Q \implies \neg P$  so  $P \implies Q$  and ...



## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show:

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:



## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$\neg P$

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1$$

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots$

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots \implies R$

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots \implies R$$

$$\neg P$$

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1$$

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \dots$$



## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \dots \implies \neg R$$

## Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \cdots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \cdots \implies \neg R$$

$$\neg P \implies R \wedge \neg R$$

# Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \cdots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \cdots \implies \neg R$$

$$\neg P \implies R \wedge \neg R \equiv \text{False}$$

# Proof by contradiction:form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \dots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \dots \implies \neg R$$

$$\neg P \implies R \wedge \neg R \equiv \text{False}$$

$$\text{or } \neg P \implies \text{False}$$

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \cdots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \cdots \implies \neg R$$

$$\neg P \implies R \wedge \neg R \equiv \text{False}$$

$$\text{or } \neg P \implies \text{False}$$

$$\text{Contrapositive of } \neg P \implies \text{False is True} \implies P.$$

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \cdots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \cdots \implies \neg R$$

$$\neg P \implies R \wedge \neg R \equiv \text{False}$$

$$\text{or } \neg P \implies \text{False}$$

Contrapositive of  $\neg P \implies \text{False}$  is  $\text{True} \implies P$ .

Theorem  $P$  is true.

## Proof by contradiction: form

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Must show: For every  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $(\frac{a}{b})^2 \neq 2$ .

A simple property (equality) should always “not” hold.

Proof by contradiction:

**Theorem:**  $P$ .

$$\neg P \implies P_1 \cdots \implies R$$

$$\neg P \implies Q_1 \cdots \implies \neg R$$

$$\neg P \implies R \wedge \neg R \equiv \text{False}$$

$$\text{or } \neg P \implies \text{False}$$

Contrapositive of  $\neg P \implies \text{False}$  is  $\text{True} \implies P$ .

Theorem  $P$  is true. And proven. □

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.



# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2$$

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2 = 4k^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$



# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2 = 4k^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$

$$b^2 = 2k^2$$

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2 = 4k^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$

$$b^2 = 2k^2$$

$b^2$  is even  $\implies b$  is even.

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2 = 4k^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$

$$b^2 = 2k^2$$

$b^2$  is even  $\implies b$  is even.

$a$  and  $b$  have a common factor.

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  **$a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.**

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2 = 4k^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$

$$b^2 = 2k^2$$

$b^2$  is even  $\implies b$  is even.

**$a$  and  $b$  have a common factor.** Contradiction.

# Contradiction

**Theorem:**  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

Assume  $\neg P$ :  $\sqrt{2} = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Reduced form:  $a$  and  $b$  have no common factors.

$$\sqrt{2}b = a$$

$$2b^2 = a^2 = 4k^2$$

$a^2$  is even  $\implies a$  is even.

$a = 2k$  for some integer  $k$

$$b^2 = 2k^2$$

$b^2$  is even  $\implies b$  is even.

$a$  and  $b$  have a common factor. Contradiction.



## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .



## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \cdots p_k) + 1.$$

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " = R) which is one of  $p_i$ .

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbf{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ ,

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbf{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbf{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p|(q - x)$

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbf{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p|(q-x) \implies p \leq (q-x)$



## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbf{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p|(q-x) \implies p \leq (q-x) = 1$ .

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbb{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p | (q - x) \implies p \leq (q - x) = 1$ .
- ▶ so  $p \leq 1$ .

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbb{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p | (q - x) \implies p \leq (q - x) = 1$ .
- ▶ so  $p \leq 1$ . (**Contradicts  $\mathbb{R}$ .**)

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbb{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p \mid (q - x) \implies p \leq (q - x) = 1$ .
- ▶ so  $p \leq 1$ . (**Contradicts  $\mathbb{R}$ .**)

The original assumption that "the theorem is false" is false, thus the theorem is proven.

## Proof by contradiction: example

**Theorem:** There are infinitely many primes.

**Proof:**

- ▶ Assume finitely many primes:  $p_1, \dots, p_k$ .
- ▶ Consider number

$$q = (p_1 \times p_2 \times \dots \times p_k) + 1.$$

- ▶  $q$  cannot be one of the primes as it is larger than any  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $q$  has prime divisor  $p$  (" $p > 1$ " =  $\mathbb{R}$ ) which is one of  $p_i$ .
- ▶  $p$  divides both  $x = p_1 \cdot p_2 \cdot \dots \cdot p_k$  and  $q$ , and divides  $q - x$ ,
- ▶  $\implies p | (q - x) \implies p \leq (q - x) = 1$ .
- ▶ so  $p \leq 1$ . (**Contradicts  $\mathbb{R}$ .**)

The original assumption that "the theorem is false" is false, thus the theorem is proven.



## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”

## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”
- ▶ No.

## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”
- ▶ No.
- ▶ The chain of reasoning started with a false statement.



## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”
- ▶ No.
- ▶ The chain of reasoning started with a false statement.

Consider example..

## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”
- ▶ No.
- ▶ The chain of reasoning started with a false statement.

Consider example..

- ▶  $2 \times 3 \times 5 \times 7 \times 11 \times 13 + 1 = 30031 = 59 \times 509$

## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”
- ▶ No.
- ▶ The chain of reasoning started with a false statement.

Consider example..

- ▶  $2 \times 3 \times 5 \times 7 \times 11 \times 13 + 1 = 30031 = 59 \times 509$
- ▶ There is a prime *in between* 13 and  $q = 30031$  that divides  $q$ .

## Product of first $k$ primes..

Did we prove?

- ▶ “The product of the first  $k$  primes plus 1 is prime.”
- ▶ No.
- ▶ The chain of reasoning started with a false statement.

Consider example..

- ▶  $2 \times 3 \times 5 \times 7 \times 11 \times 13 + 1 = 30031 = 59 \times 509$
- ▶ There is a prime *in between* 13 and  $q = 30031$  that divides  $q$ .
- ▶ Proof assumed no primes *in between*  $p_k$  and  $q$ .

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$



## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

$$y = (2k + 1). \quad y^3 = 8k^3 + 24k^2 + 24k + 1 = 2(4k^3 + 12k^2 + 12k) + 1.$$

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

$$y = (2k + 1). \quad y^3 = 8k^3 + 24k^2 + 24k + 1 = 2(4k^3 + 12k^2 + 12k) + 1.$$

Odd times an odd?

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

$$y = (2k + 1). \quad y^3 = 8k^3 + 24k^2 + 24k + 1 = 2(4k^3 + 12k^2 + 12k) + 1.$$

Odd times an odd? Odd.

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

$$y = (2k + 1). \quad y^3 = 8k^3 + 24k^2 + 24k + 1 = 2(4k^3 + 12k^2 + 12k) + 1.$$

Odd times an odd? Odd.

Any power of an odd number?

## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

$$y = (2k + 1). \quad y^3 = 8k^3 + 24k^2 + 24k + 1 = 2(4k^3 + 12k^2 + 12k) + 1.$$

Odd times an odd? Odd.

Any power of an odd number? Odd.

Idea:  $(2k + 1)^n$  has terms

(a) with the last term being 1



## Poll: Odds and evens.

$x$  is even,  $y$  is odd.

Even numbers are divisible by 2.

Which are even?

(A)  $x^3$

(B)  $y^3$

(C)  $x + 5x$

(D)  $xy$

(E)  $xy^5$

(F)  $x + y$

A, D, E all contain a factor of 2.

$x = 2k$ , and  $x^3 = 8k = 2(4k)$  and is even.

$y^3$ . Odd?

$$y = (2k + 1). y^3 = 8k^3 + 24k^2 + 24k + 1 = 2(4k^3 + 12k^2 + 12k) + 1.$$

Odd times an odd? Odd.

Any power of an odd number? Odd.

Idea:  $(2k + 1)^n$  has terms

(a) with the last term being 1

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  
*then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.*

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even!

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .



## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = even.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 3:  $a$  odd,  $b$  even: odd - even + even = odd. **Not possible.**

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 3:  $a$  odd,  $b$  even: odd - even + even = odd. **Not possible.**



## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 3:  $a$  odd,  $b$  even: odd - even + even = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 4:  $a$  even,  $b$  even: even - even + even = even.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 3:  $a$  odd,  $b$  even: odd - even + even = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 4:  $a$  even,  $b$  even: even - even + even = even. **Possible.**

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 3:  $a$  odd,  $b$  even: odd - even + even = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 4:  $a$  even,  $b$  even: even - even + even = even. **Possible.**

The fourth case is the only one possible,

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:**  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  has no solution in the rationals.

**Proof:** First a lemma...

**Lemma:** If  $x$  is a solution to  $x^5 - x + 1 = 0$  and  $x = a/b$  for  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then both  $a$  and  $b$  are even.

Reduced form  $\frac{a}{b}$ :  $a$  and  $b$  can't both be even! + Lemma  
 $\implies$  no rational solution. □

**Proof of lemma:** Assume a solution of the form  $a/b$ .

$$\left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^5 - \frac{a}{b} + 1 = 0$$

Multiply by  $b^5$ ,

$$a^5 - ab^4 + b^5 = 0$$

Case 1:  $a$  odd,  $b$  odd: odd - odd + odd = even. **Not possible.**

Case 2:  $a$  even,  $b$  odd: even - even + odd = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 3:  $a$  odd,  $b$  even: odd - even + even = odd. **Not possible.**

Case 4:  $a$  even,  $b$  even: even - even + even = even. **Possible.**

The fourth case is the only one possible, so the lemma follows. □

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!



## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y =$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}}$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}}$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2.$$

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2.$$

Thus, we have irrational  $x$  and  $y$  with a rational  $x^y$  (i.e., 2).



## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2.$$

Thus, we have irrational  $x$  and  $y$  with a rational  $x^y$  (i.e., 2).

One of the cases is true so theorem holds.

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2.$$

Thus, we have irrational  $x$  and  $y$  with a rational  $x^y$  (i.e., 2).

One of the cases is true so theorem holds. □

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2.$$

Thus, we have irrational  $x$  and  $y$  with a rational  $x^y$  (i.e., 2).

One of the cases is true so theorem holds. □

Question: Which case holds?

## Proof by cases.

**Theorem:** There exist irrational  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$ .

Case 1:  $x^y = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational. Done!

Case 2:  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.

▶ New values:  $x = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$ ,  $y = \sqrt{2}$ .

▶

$$x^y = \left(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}\right)^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2.$$

Thus, we have irrational  $x$  and  $y$  with a rational  $x^y$  (i.e., 2).

One of the cases is true so theorem holds. □

Question: Which case holds? Don't know!!!

## Poll: proof review.

Which of the following are (certainly) true?

## Poll: proof review.

Which of the following are (certainly) true?

(A)  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

(B)  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

(C)  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational or it isn't.

(D)  $(2^{\sqrt{2}})^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

## Poll: proof review.

Which of the following are (certainly) true?

(A)  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

(B)  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

(C)  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational or it isn't.

(D)  $(2^{\sqrt{2}})^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

(A),(C),(D)

## Poll: proof review.

Which of the following are (certainly) true?

(A)  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

(B)  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

(C)  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational or it isn't.

(D)  $(2^{\sqrt{2}})^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.

(A),(C),(D)

(B) I don't know.



Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Start with  $12 = 12$ .

Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Start with  $12 = 12$ .

Divide one side by 3 and the other by 4 to get

$$4 = 3.$$

Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Start with  $12 = 12$ .

Divide one side by 3 and the other by 4 to get

$$4 = 3.$$

By commutativity

Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Start with  $12 = 12$ .

Divide one side by 3 and the other by 4 to get

$$4 = 3.$$

By commutativity theorem holds.

Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Start with  $12 = 12$ .

Divide one side by 3 and the other by 4 to get  
 $4 = 3$ .

By commutativity theorem holds.



# Be careful.

**Theorem:**  $3 = 4$

**Proof:** Assume  $3 = 4$ .

Start with  $12 = 12$ .

Divide one side by 3 and the other by 4 to get  
 $4 = 3$ .

By commutativity theorem holds. □

Don't assume what you want to prove!



Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:**

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$





## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$



Poll: What is the problem?

- (A) Assumed what you were proving.
- (B) No problem. Its fine.
- (C)  $x - y$  is zero.
- (D) Can't multiply by zero in a proof.

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$



Poll: What is the problem?

- (A) Assumed what you were proving.
- (B) No problem. Its fine.
- (C)  $x - y$  is zero.
- (D) Can't multiply by zero in a proof.

Dividing by zero is no good.

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$



Poll: What is the problem?

- (A) Assumed what you were proving.
- (B) No problem. Its fine.
- (C)  $x - y$  is zero.
- (D) Can't multiply by zero in a proof.

Dividing by zero is no good. **Multiplying by zero is wierdly cool!**

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$



Poll: What is the problem?

- (A) Assumed what you were proving.
- (B) No problem. Its fine.
- (C)  $x - y$  is zero.
- (D) Can't multiply by zero in a proof.

Dividing by zero is no good. **Multiplying by zero is wierdly cool!**

Also: Multiplying inequalities by a negative.

## Be really careful!

**Theorem:**  $1 = 2$

**Proof:** For  $x = y$ , we have

$$(x^2 - xy) = x^2 - y^2$$

$$x(x - y) = (x + y)(x - y)$$

$$x = (x + y)$$

$$x = 2x$$

$$1 = 2$$



Poll: What is the problem?

- (A) Assumed what you were proving.
- (B) No problem. Its fine.
- (C)  $x - y$  is zero.
- (D) Can't multiply by zero in a proof.

Dividing by zero is no good. **Multiplying by zero is wierdly cool!**

Also: Multiplying inequalities by a negative.

$P \implies Q$  does not mean  $Q \implies P$ .

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ .

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ .



## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b - c)$ .

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b - c)$ .

By Contraposition:

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b - c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ .

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b - c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b - c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$



## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ .

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b - c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$ . Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False**.

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.



## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.

Careful when proving!

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.

Careful when proving!

**Don't assume the theorem.**

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.

Careful when proving!

**Don't assume the theorem. Divide by zero.**

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.

Careful when proving!

**Don't assume the theorem. Divide by zero. Watch converse.**

## Summary: Note 2.

Direct Proof:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$ . Assume  $P$ . Prove  $Q$ .

$a|b$  and  $a|c \implies a|(b-c)$ .

By Contraposition:

To Prove:  $P \implies Q$  Assume  $\neg Q$ . Prove  $\neg P$ .

$n^2$  is odd  $\implies n$  is odd.  $\equiv n$  is even  $\implies n^2$  is even.

By Contradiction:

To Prove:  $P$  Assume  $\neg P$ . Prove **False** .

$\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$  with no common factors....

By Cases: informal.

Universal: show that statement holds in all cases.

Existence: used cases where one is true.

Either  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}$  worked.

or  $\sqrt{2}$  and  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  worked.

Careful when proving!

**Don't assume the theorem. Divide by zero. Watch converse. ...**

## CS70: Note 3. Induction!

Poll. What's the biggest number?

(A) 100

(B) 101

(C)  $n+1$

(D) infinity.

(E) This is about the “recursive leap of faith.”